

# 禪與天主教四年一次的對話於聖城舉行

## Zen/Chan - Catholic Dialogue Opens New Quadrennium

坎能梯索神父 寫於華盛頓

BY FR. CANON FRANCIS TISO ON FEBRUARY 2, 2007, WASHINGTON, D.C.

林常青博士 中譯

CHINESE TRANSLATED BY LIN CHARNG CHING, PHD.



第二屆四年一期的西海岸天主教與佛教的首次對話，是在加州瑜珈市的萬佛聖城召開的，題目是：「住在基督裏，皈依佛」。二〇〇七年一月二十四至二十七日的會議，是由加州柏克萊世界宗教研究院的恆實法師與美國天主教主教協會下全基督教與宗教事務秘書處的副主任坎能·梯索神父共同主持。梯索神父是替代天主教共同主席約翰·衛司特——三藩市副主教，最近履新猶他州鹽湖城主教。

對話由公開的會議開始，出席的有瑜珈市的宗教領袖與萬佛聖城（宣化上人1918-1995所創立）出家眾、學生，和教職員。與會者中一組組員談論「禪與天主教」對話的特質，旨在銜接宣化上人與于斌樞機主教長久友誼所提倡之「宗教對話」的初衷。特別是，小組探討我們個別的傳統；那些眾多的主題，已是過去四年來我們對話的重心：行菩薩道與行基督道（2003）；心與智的轉化：探討戒律（2004）；修行：轉變的方法（2005）；道上相逢（2006）等。這些對話已經建立起堅固友誼，也使彼此對對方的術語、歷史與修行有更深一層的瞭解。與會人員現在更邁向一個新系列的對話，來討論因現代世俗文化狀況所衍生的宗教性問題。

在兩天的心靈修持和無旁聽者的對話中，與會人員審視基督徒與佛教徒的信條基礎。佛教的皈依修持，包含皈依或仰賴佛陀，佛陀的教誨，

The first in a second quadrennium of dialogues between Catholics and Buddhists on the West Coast was held at the City of the Ten Thousand Buddhas, Ukiah, California, on the topic: "Abiding in Christ; Taking Refuge in the Buddha". The January 24-27, 2007 meeting was co-chaired by Venerable Rev. Heng Sure of the Institute for World Religions, Berkeley, California, and by The Rev. Canon Francis V. Tiso, Associate Director of the Secretariat for Ecumenical and Interreligious Affairs of the USCCB. Fr. Tiso was substituting for the Catholic co-chair, M. R. John C. Wester, auxiliary bishop of San Francisco and newly designated Bishop of Salt Lake City, Utah.

The dialogue began with a public session, attended by Ukiah religious leadership and by monastics, students, and faculty of the City of Ten Thousand Buddhas [established by the late Ven. Master Hsüan Hua (1918-1995)]. A panel of participants discussed the unique features of this dialogue, linking it to the original intention of Venerable Master Hua to promote interreligious dialogue, based on his long friendship with Paul Cardinal Yü Bin. In particular, the panel explored those great themes of our respective traditions that have been at the heart of our previous four years of dialogue: Walking the Bodhisattva Path/Walking the Christ Path (2003); Transformation of Hearts and Minds: Approaches to Precepts (2004); Practice: Means Toward Transformation (2005); Meeting on the Path (2006). These dialogues have built strong bonds of friendship and have contributed to a deeper understanding of one another's terminologies, histories, and practices. The participants are now moving into a new series of dialogues that will ask religious questions arising from the conditions of contemporary, secular culture.

In the course of two days of spiritual exercises and closed-



以及覺悟的團體（意即佛教的佛、法、僧三寶），與天主教啟蒙的聖禮（洗禮、堅信禮和聖餐）相對照，兩者都包括有進入精神生活的基礎，也都繼續影響對日常生活中的信仰整合。

加州Big Sur新卡木多力修道院的羅伯海爾神父從〈新約聖經·聖約翰章〉和〈聖保羅章〉的文字裡頭提出一個議題：「住在基督裏」。〈新約〉作者在這方面所用傳統的合一形象主要是以葡萄樹與枝子，身子與肢體來比喻。〈新約聖經〉中充滿了進入、結合、道成肉身以及參與的字眼，甚至引用希伯來先知的文章中「客人、朋友、所愛的，與配偶」的象徵。這些關係的象徵都是基督徒通過浸禮對「三聖一體」——聖父、聖子與聖靈——的生活之參與。既然這些比喻是指關係，就指點我們注意不斷地參與在神大愛的分享中；此乃是我們最深的中心與真實的自我。所有的操練就是要達到最終目標：帶著恩典並在他旨意中參與上帝的生活。屬靈生活的操練使基督徒更能全面地、自覺地、有果效地領受上帝的生命。甚至連屬靈的語言都是即時的，或者用「口吃」來形容更貼切，是讓人天然的意識更深地進入那「神秘」的交流，而甚於去定義神秘的功夫之階段與狀態。

加拿大卑詩省溫哥華金佛寺的恆持法師探討在禪宗裡，信仰的本質乃三皈依（皈依佛、法、僧）之基礎。皈依是源於信仰經過思考而成熟的。這種皈依儀式需要從戒師依據該門派的傳統進行，在儀式中觀想，使個人真正的內在（即眾生皆具之佛性）展現開來，這就是將來開悟的覺性。因此，信仰是增強信心、信賴和深信不疑。此次大乘佛教參加者公認的一個重要特性是「成熟」這一主題：皈依，並不僅僅是責任或遵循家庭信仰，而是個人長久以來在其意識中發展出來的善根力之反應——一個人的善根成熟了，並在三寶（佛、法、僧）中持續發展。

對話也轉換到基督教「三聖一體」的神學論與佛教教導的「佛陀三身（化身、報身、法

session dialogues, the participants examined the basis of Christian and Buddhist commitments. The Buddhist “Refuge” practice, entailing “taking refuge in, or relying upon, the Buddha, his Teachings, and the enlightening Community (the “Three Jewels” of Buddha, Dharma, and Sangha), was paired with the Catholic Sacraments of Initiation (Baptism, Confirmation, and Eucharist): both constitute the basis for entry into the spiritual life, both continue to impact the integration of faith with daily life.

Fr. Robert Hale of New Camaldoli Monastery, Big Sur, California, developed the topic of “Abiding in Christ” in writings of St. John and St. Paul in the New Testament. The classic images of organic unity: the vine and the branches, the body and its members, are the primary metaphors on which the New Testament writers base their presentation of abiding in Christ. The New Testament is rich in the language of embodiment, incorporation, enfleshment, and participation, even as it borrows the images of the Guest, the Friend, the Beloved, the Spouse from Hebrew prophetic writings. All the relational images refer to the Christian’s participation in the life of the Blessed Trinity, Father, Son and Holy Spirit, conferred in the Sacrament of Baptism. Since the metaphors are relational, they direct our attention to a dynamic participation in the shared love of God, which constitutes our deepest center and true self. All ascetic practice is ordered to that end: the gracious, divinizing participation in the life of God. Practices of the spiritual life dispose the Christian to receive the gift of divine life more fully, consciously and fruitfully. Even the “language” of spiritual is provisional and, as it were, “a stuttering” meant more to nudge human consciousness more deeply into communion with the gift given as “mystery” than to define stages and states of mystical attainment.

Venerable Rev. Heng Chih of Gold Buddha Monastery, Vancouver, British Columbia, examined the nature of faith as the basis for Taking Refuge in Buddha, Dharma, and Sangha in the Ch’an Buddhist tradition. One makes the choice of taking refuge on the basis of a faith that has been matured through reflection. The phenomenology of the act of taking refuge entails going before a qualified spiritual preceptor who performs the rite in accordance with the traditions of the lineage. The prior action of reflection can then unfold in meditative practice, which is the way to actualize one’s inherent potential (i.e. Buddha Nature, which is shared by all sentient beings), which is the capacity to attain enlightenment. Faith itself is thus seen as intensifying confidence, reliance, or certitude. One of the key features acknowledged by our Mahayana Buddhist participants was the theme of maturation: one takes refuge, not merely out of obligation or family custom, but as a personal response to the good impulses that have been developing over a long period of time within one’s consciousness: one’s karma has ripened to this point and will continue to develop within the “sphere” of the Three Jewels (Buddha, Dharma, and Sangha).

身)」之相似與相異的討論；因為它們是精神皈依之「對象」，須要去瞭解，以便體會其奉行之儀式。我們也重新探討恆實法師與法蘭西斯·梯索神父在二〇〇四年所介紹的佛教與基督術語。

保存大乘佛教教導基金會（藏傳佛教格魯派的一個分支）的葛隆·羅旃·蒙蘭從修道的次第歸位皈依儀式，是眾生為眾生真正快樂之需求而推動的。真正的快樂需要自己遠離會墮生於較低層次業道的行為。達到真正的快樂是要得到像圓覺的佛陀一樣的特質。從儀式範圍來看，皈依的行為結合了一個人善根成熟的自我覺醒，與表示一個人外在「支持」所做的禮儀，例如在佛像或是皈依法會的畫卷前禮拜。由對禮拜對象的說明，引到使用佛像或是其他實物作觀想的熱烈討論。

從倫理的觀點看，一個人隨著儀式以內在的決心來對自己的行為負責，並棄捨自欺與怪罪他人。葛隆蒙蘭摘要敘述此儀軌與其義務，並以此和受在家戒之儀軌與更高層的密教修持之儀軌做比較。這些高層修行反映出一個人在加深的師徒關係下，致力於菩薩道之增長的覺知。

梯索神父則從一個牧師的觀點來介紹基督教成人入會儀式，以強調在後梵諦岡二代天主教儀式的規範特色；並與佛教基於一個人可能喚醒信仰並皈依三寶之主題——「趨向心靈成熟的自我覺知」——來相比較。在支持基督教以聖靈引領為恩典的信念之時所舉行的嬰孩浸信禮，可能在實踐時反而遮障人類對神祉信仰反應的觀點。因此，一些成人與嬰孩的浸信禮試圖強調個人信仰的需要，並在實質的天主教生活中得到肯定。

這次對話，跟主題有關的討論範圍項目十分豐富，例如，我們重新討論一些心靈生活的雙邊關係：肯定神論與否

The dialogue moved into a discussion of similarities and differences in Christian Trinitarian Theology and Buddhist teachings on the Three Bodies of the Buddha (Trikaya), since these are the transcendent “objects” of adherence which need to be understood so as to appreciate their ritualization. The conversation revisited crucial Buddhist and Christian terminology as presented in the 2004 meeting by Rev. Heng Sure and by Fr. Francis Tiso.

Gelong Lozan Monlam of the Foundation for the Preservation of the Mahayana Teachings (a branch of Tibetan Gelukpa practice), situated the rite of taking refuge in the context of the Stages of the Path (lam rim), motivated by the quest for authentic happiness for and by all beings. Authentic happiness requires distancing oneself from actions leading to rebirth in lower realms of karma-driven existence. Attainment of happiness constitutes acquiring the qualities of a Fully Enlightened Buddha. In its ritual context, the act of taking refuge engages one’s subjective awareness of the maturation of roots of goodness along with the use of external “supports” for one’s ritual gestures, e.g. prostrations before a statue of the Buddha or a scroll painting of the Refuge Assembly. The description of ritual objects led to a lively discussion of the use of statues and other physical objects in contemplative practice.

From the ethical perspective, one accompanies the ritual act with an inner determination to take responsibility for one’s deeds and to renounce self-victimization and blaming others. Gelong Monlam outlined the rite and its obligations, comparing it to the rite of taking lay precepts and to the rites of tantric commitment at more advanced stages of practice. These higher commitments reflect one’s growing awareness of the implications of engaging the path of a Bodhisattva in the context of a deepening teacher-disciple relationship.

Fr. Tiso presented a pastoral perspective on the Rite of Christian Initiation of Adults in order to underscore its “normative” character for post-Vatican II Catholic initiation, comparing it to the Buddhist theme of “coming to subjective awareness of one’s spiritual maturation,” upon which one might awaken faith and take refuge in the Three Jewels. The practice of infant baptism, while sustaining the Christian conviction about grace as a divine initiative, may in practice obscure the aspect of the human faith-response to the divine gift. Therefore, several features of the rites of adult and infant baptism seek to emphasize the need for personal faith, affirmed within the life of a concrete Catholic community.

This dialogue was rich in the range of topics discussed in relation to the basic themes presented. For example, we revisited some of the great dyads of the spiritual life; the distinction between cataphatic and apophatic spirituality, between the active life and the contemplative life, between attainment of wisdom and the practice of compassion, between verbalization and ineffability, between experience and that which transcends even the category of experience.



定神論，活性生活與觀想生活，獲得智慧與修行慈悲，言說與不可言喻，經驗與凌駕經驗領域。

有個與會者相當感興趣的議題：我們對傳達這些教導給學生與社區的責任。有多少是可以適用於現代生活環境？有多少是需要遵循傳統的模式？在某一特定傳統「內」是代表什麼？在傳統「外」又是代表什麼？有什麼「認證法則」可以認定特定門派與教法的真偽嗎？類似的教化是否提供足夠的證據，讓我們可以歸納出人類心靈修行之成就是有共同的基礎？聖職人員相似的道德觀與賢聖的表徵是否代表所有傳統都有共同的精神基礎？以日常生活為基準，教義的系統與在道上生活之關連是什麼？在佛教徒與基督徒精神生活的架構裡頭，上帝與神靈的價值是什麼？在女性精神生活上，哪些是有性別特異性？從女性神秘主義者的生活與著述，我們能學習到任何有關這個嗎？改變信仰與精神提昇有何關係？什麼是宗派與世界宗教傳統在文化與氣氛上的差別？

明年的聚會，計畫在二〇〇八年一月三十日至二月二日在加州柏靈根的慈悲中心舉行。議題將根據今年對「遵循和皈依」研究的瞭解，來徵詢「接下來做什麼」。預定發表的內容：教士、出家眾、精神導師與教師的形成，在家眾培訓與領導力之角色，「道」之社會服務，心靈成熟的長期徵兆。有兩個小組被指派準備開幕的介紹。一如以往，每天的一部份時間將專用於靜坐，基督徒禱告與聖餐，及有指導的觀想修練。

There was great interest in the subject of our responsibilities in transmitting these teachings to our students and communities. How much can be adapted to contemporary circumstances? How much needs to be modeled in accord with tradition? What does it mean to be “in” a particular tradition? What does it mean to be “outside” the tradition? Are there “rules of thumb” for determining the authenticity of particular lineages and teachings? Do similar teachings provide sufficient evidence on which we can infer the existence of a common basis in human nature for spiritual attainments? Do similar moral values and signs of holiness in revered persons indicate a common basis for spirituality that is valid across traditions? What is the connection between doctrinal systems and living our spiritual paths on a daily basis? What is the value of the term “God” or “gods” in Buddhist and Christian constructions of spiritual life? What aspects of women’s spiritual lives are gender-specific? Can we learn anything about this from the lives and writings of women mystics? What is the relationship between conversion and spiritual transformation? What are the cultural and “atmospheric” distinctions that we note among lineages and great world traditions?

Next year’s gathering is planned for January 30 to February 2, 2008 at Mercy Center, Burlingame, California. The theme builds upon this year’s efforts to understand “abiding and refuge” to ask: “Then What?” Proposed presentations will explore the formation of clergy, monastics, spiritual directors, and teachers; lay training and leadership roles; social service as ‘path’; the long term signs of spiritual maturation. Two teams were assigned to the task of preparing innovative presentations. Part of each day will again be dedicated to silent meditation, Christian prayer and Eucharist, and guided contemplative exercises.

